



**CENTER FOR INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW**

October 4, 2006

Commissioner Peter Mandelson  
Trade Directorate-General  
European Commission  
B-1049 Brussels

**Subject: Open dispute settlement hearings in the World Trade Organization**

Dear Commissioner Mandelson:

We would like to express our appreciation to the European Commission for consenting to have the hearings in the World Trade Organization (WTO) *Beef Hormones* case in September 2005 and September/October 2006 available to the public in Geneva via closed-circuit television. Attorneys from our Geneva office attended both televised sessions and confirm that the recent process went entirely smoothly, as did the first session in 2005. You and the Commission are to be congratulated for your commitment to greater transparency in WTO dispute settlement, and for taking the first step in opening these hearings to the public.

Inevitably, the number of persons able to view these proceedings is small, especially given the manifest importance of the issues involved. Only a very limited number of interested individuals and groups have the substantial financial resources required to travel to Geneva and spend several days at the WTO. Since many interested citizens, especially those from developing countries, are unable to spend the time and money to travel to Geneva to witness the proceedings in person, the result is that much of civil society effectively does not have access to the hearings. This is particularly true with respect to ordinary citizens and non-industry groups from the Global South.

Web-casting, i.e., broadcasting via the Internet, is the logical way to resolve this dilemma and to further increase the transparency and credibility of the WTO dispute settlement process. Citizens and groups around the world have access to the Internet, which would eliminate the access limitations inherent in the current practice. As with closed-circuit televising of WTO panel hearings, web-casting would neither delay the panel process nor interfere with it in any other way. Moreover, web-casting would be more efficient than using closed-circuit television in several respects: it would not

require the WTO to undertake the pre-hearing clearance process it now conducts before individuals are allowed into the WTO premises to watch the proceedings; it would not require WTO security personnel to clear people for entrance the day of the proceeding; and it would not require a physical space for observers to watch the hearings. Because the WTO already provides web-casting of major events and for training purposes, it is clear that the WTO possesses the technical capacity to web-cast, as well as the willingness to enable citizens of the world to participate in WTO events via the Internet.

We believe that web-casting should be the EC's policy with respect to all WTO dispute settlement hearings, and that it should be considered now in that general context, without reference to any specific dispute. We therefore respectfully request that the European Commission adopt an official policy to request open web-cast hearings at the WTO whenever it is involved as a party to a dispute.

Thank you in advance for considering this request, and please let us know if we can provide any further information about it.

Yours sincerely,



Daniel Barstow Magraw  
President,  
Center for International Environmental Law (CIEL)



Tony Long  
Director,  
WWF European Policy Office