

**Reply form**  
**for the public consultation on**  
**Proposal for a Commission definition of the term "nanomaterial"**  
**Send to [ENV-NANO-CONSULTATION@ec.europa.eu](mailto:ENV-NANO-CONSULTATION@ec.europa.eu)**

Name	Azoulay / Duprez
Surname	David / Louise
Title	Managing Attorney / Policy Officer
Name of organisation	<p><b>Centre for International Environmental Law (CIEL)</b>  <b>European Environmental Bureau (EEB)</b></p> <p><b>On behalf of:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Centre for International Environmental Law (CIEL)</li> <li>2. European Environmental Bureau (EEB)</li> <li>3. Client Earth</li> <li>4. European Environmental Citizens' Organisation for Standardisation</li> <li>5. Food and Water Watch Europe</li> <li>6. Friends of the Earth Europe</li> <li>7. Greenpeace Europe</li> <li>8. Health &amp; Environment Alliance</li> <li>9. Health Care Without Harm Europe</li> <li>10. Pesticide Action Network Europe</li> <li>11. Women in Europe for a Common Future</li> <li>12. Action For Breast Cancer Foundation</li> <li>13. Associazione Malattie da Intossicazione Cronica e/o Ambientale</li> <li>14. Bund für Umwelt und Naturschutz Deutschland e.V. (BUND/ FoE Germany)</li> <li>15. Deutscher Naturschutzring</li> <li>16. EU Environmental Bureau Austria / EU-Umweltbüro</li> <li>17. Federation inter-environnement Wallonie</li> <li>18. France nature Environnement</li> <li>19. Initiativ Liewensufank</li> <li>20. Institute for Sustainable Development</li> <li>21. International Baby Food Action Network (IBFAN) Luxembourg</li> <li>22. International Chemical Secretariat – ChemSec (Sweden)</li> <li>23. Mediterranean Information Office for Environment, Culture and Sustainable Development (MIO –ECSDE)</li> <li>24. Pestizid Aktions-Netzwerk e.V. / Pesticide Action Network - Germany</li> <li>25. The Irish Doctors Environmental Association (IDEA)</li> <li>26. APROMAC (Associação de Proteção ao meio Ambiente de Cianorte ) (Brésil)</li> <li>27. Center for Food Safety (USA)</li> <li>28. Centro de Análisis y Acción en Tóxicos y sus Alternativas (CAATA) (Mexico)</li> <li>29. Citizen against chemical pollution (Japan)</li> </ol>

	30. Commonweal (USA) 31. Confederacion General del Trabajo de la Republica Argentina 32. Food and Water Watch US 33. Friends of the Earth United States 34. Grassroots Alliance PERESVET (Russia) 35. Humane Society International (USA) 36. Institute for Agriculture and Trade Policy (IATP) (USA) 37. International Center for Technology Assessment (ICTA) (USA) 38. International PoPs Elimination Network (IPEN) 39. Island Sustainability Alliance (C.I.) Inc. (Cook Islands) 40. Nanotechnology Citizen Engagement Organization (NanoCEO) (USA) 41. National Resources Defense Council (NRDC) (USA) 42. National Toxic Network Inc. (Australia) 43. Pesticide Action Network Aotearoa (New Zealand) 44. Red de Accion sobre Plaguicidas y sus Alternativas para América Latina (RAP-AL)/ Pesticide Action Network Latin America (Mexico) 45. SEEPOM (Société d'Education Environnementale et de Protection des Oiseaux au Maroc) 46. Toxisphera (Brazil)
Postal address	<b>Centre for International Environmental Law (CIEL)</b> Rue des Savoises, 15 1205 Geneva Switzerland  <b>European Environmental Bureau (EEB)</b> 34, Bd. de Waterloo B-1000 Brussels Belgium
Country	Switzerland / Belgium
E-mail address	<a href="mailto:dazoulay@ciel.org">dazoulay@ciel.org</a> / <a href="mailto:louise.duprez@eeb.org">louise.duprez@eeb.org</a>
Phone number	CIEL: +41 22 321 47 74 EEB: +32 2 289 13 07

*With this consultation we are seeking your reasoned opinion, to be described below. Please note we **do not accept** comments in track changes in the European Commission proposed text. The consultation closes on 19 November 2010.*

### **European Environmental Bureau (EEB) ID number: 06798511314-27**

International and European environmental, health, and animal protection NGOs welcome the publication of a European Commission draft recommendation on the definition of the term "nanomaterial".

The adoption of an overarching, broadly applicable definition of nanomaterials will enable long awaited regulatory activities to start catching up with market development to ensure safe and responsible product development.

In particular, NGOs welcome the specific provisions of:

- **Paragraph 7**, calling for a regular review of the definition;
- **Paragraph 8**, in particular provisions based on SCENIHR's recommendation to base size distribution on particle numbers rather than mass concentration;
- **Paragraph 9**, in that it specifies the inclusion of aggregates and agglomerates,
- **Paragraph 10**, about the provision of additional guidance, but insist that the preparation and implementation of such guidelines should not delay the use and implementation of the recommended definition, nor undermine the objective of high level of protection of humans and the environment;
- **Paragraph 11**, in particular the reference to the possible inclusion of other materials, notably, materials such as fullerenes, smaller than 1nm;
- **Paragraph 12**, as the only way to give coherence to the burgeoning field of nanomaterials regulation in the EU.

On the draft proposed definition itself, environmental, health and animal protection NGOs would like to make the following comments:

The present understanding of nanomaterials properties and potential health and environmental impacts is still very limited and therefore warrants much research and careful evaluation.

Based on early evidence showing that some particles up to several hundred nanometers share many of the novel properties of nanomaterials under 100nm that are critical for risk assessment<sup>1</sup>, and on SCENIHR's acknowledgment that science cannot set an upper size limit value for nano-properties, NGOs favour a larger size range (i.e. 0,3 to 300 nm<sup>2</sup>) to define nanomaterials. This larger size range would allow more research and a better understanding of all nanomaterials, and whether particular nanomaterials may present concerns for human health or not<sup>3</sup>, and importantly, in what size range.

In this context, and as described in the technical comments provided to the SCENIHR's opinion, we call for the undertaking of a sensitivity analysis, to verify that the adopted size range captures as much material as possible about which there is already concern, while avoiding materials that do not give rise to nano scale-related concerns. This study should start immediately after the adoption and implementation of the proposed definition in order to be considered in the future revision process of the definition mentioned in paragraph 7 of the Commission's proposal.

In the meantime, signatories welcome the adoption of a reasonable and workable 1% threshold of the particle number size distribution as a way to include in the definition, and put under scrutiny, certain materials, which may exhibit nano specific hazardous properties in the larger size range.

Should this 1% threshold be modified pursuant to this consultation, it is our position that the size range chosen in this definition (1-100nm) should also be modified to a higher range

---

<sup>1</sup> These novel properties include very high reactivity, bioactivity and bioavailability, increased influence of particle surface effects, strong particle surface adhesion and strong ability to bind proteins. Cedervall et al, 2007; Garnett and Kallinteri 2006; Linse et al. 2007.

<sup>2</sup> See for example Friends of the Earth Australia's Discussion paper on nanotechnology standardisation and nomenclature issues, August 2008, available at [http://www.ecostandard.org/downloads\\_a/2008-10-06\\_foea\\_nanotechnology.pdf](http://www.ecostandard.org/downloads_a/2008-10-06_foea_nanotechnology.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> As stressed by SCENIHR's opinion that "[the] uncertainty (...) warrants the careful evaluation of possible risks associated with nanotechnology products" and that "Although the existing toxicological and ecotoxicological methods are appropriate to assess many of the hazards associated with the products and processes involving nanomaterials, they may not be sufficient to address all the hazards (...) it cannot be assumed that current scientific knowledge has elucidated all the potential adverse effects of nanomaterials" (SCENHIR-June 2007)

(such as 0,3-300 nm) to allow the definition to capture as much material as possible about which there is already concern (including fullerenes).

We would like to emphasise that any attempt to narrow the scope of a definition for nanomaterials at this stage could lead to potentially harmful substances escaping scrutiny, as well as to the potential exclusion in the future of substances that are presently not engineered to nano-sizes and configurations. Such a narrowed definition would deprive legislators of the necessary flexibility that is critical for the regulation of present issues, as well as for more complex upcoming challenges, including future generations of nanomaterials.

List of signatories:

- ***European NGOs***

**Centre for International Environmental Law**

Rue des Savoises, 15  
1205 Geneva  
Switzerland

**European Environmental Bureau**

Federation of Environmental Citizens Organisations  
34, Bd. de Waterloo  
B-1000 Brussels  
Belgium

**Client Earth**

36 Avenue de Tervueren,  
1040 Brussels  
Belgium

**European Environmental Citizens' Organisation for Standardisation**

Mundo-B  
Rue d'Edimbourg, 26  
B-1050 Brussels  
Belgium

**Food and Water Watch Europe**

Rue d'Edimbourg 26  
Brussels 1050  
Belgium

**Friends of the Earth Europe**

Postal address: Mundo-b building,  
Rue d-Edimbourg 26,  
1050 Brussels  
Belgium

**Greenpeace Europe**

Belliardstraat 199  
1040 Brussels  
Belgium

**Health & Environment Alliance**

28 Boulevard Charlemagne  
B-1000 Brussels  
Belgium

**Health Care Without Harm Europe**

Rue de la Pépinière 1  
1000 Brussels  
Belgium

**Pesticide Action Network Europe**

Rue de la Pépinière 1  
1000 Brussels  
Belgium

**Women in Europe for a Common Future**

Sankt Jakobs Platz 10  
80331 München  
Germany

- ***European national NGOs***

**Action For Breast Cancer Foundation**

27, Papa Pawlu V Street  
Qawra, St. Paul's Bay  
SPB 1111  
Malta

**Associazione Malattie da Intossicazione Cronica e/o Ambientale**

A.M.I.C.A.  
P.O .Box 3131  
00121 Rome  
Italy

**Bund für Umwelt und Naturschutz Deutschland e.V. (BUND)**

**Friends of the Earth Germany**

Am Kölnischen Park 1  
10179 Berlin  
Germany

**Deutscher Naturschutzring**

Koblenzer Straße 65  
53173 Bonn  
Germany

**EU Environmental Bureau Austria**

EU-Umweltbüro  
Strozzigasse 10/7-9  
1080 Vienna  
Austria

**Federation Inter-Environnement Wallonie**

98 rue Nanon  
5000 Namur  
Belgium

**France nature Environnement**

81-83 bd Port-Royal  
75013 Paris  
France

**Initiativ Liewensufank**

20, rue de Contern  
L-5955 Itzig  
Luxemburg

**Institute for Sustainable Development**

Metelkova 6  
1000 Ljubljana  
Slovenia

**International Baby Food Action Network (IBFAN) Luxembourg**

GIFA  
Avenue de la Paix 11  
1202 Geneva  
Switzerland

**Internationl chemical Secretariat (Chemsec)**

P.O.Box 7005,  
SE - 402 31 Göteborg  
Sweden

**MIO –ECSDE**

Mediterranean Information Office for Environment, Culture and Sustainable Development  
12, Kyrristou str. 105 56  
Athens  
Greece

**Pestizid Aktions-Netzwerk e.V.**

Pesticide Action Network - Germany  
Nernstweg 32  
D - 22765 Hamburg  
Germany

**The Irish Doctors Environmental Association**

IDEA  
Millbrook Clinic, Bandon,  
Co Cork  
Ireland

- ***International NGOs***

**APROMAC (Associação de Proteção ao meio Ambiente de Cianorte)**

Rua Afonso Pena SN - Fundos da Extensão da UEM em Cianorte  
CEP: 87200-000  
CIANORTE - PARANÁ  
Brazil

**Centro de Análisis y Acción en Tóxicos y sus Alternativas (CAATA)**

Amado Nervo 23, int 2, Col San Juanito, Texcoco. Edo de Mexico  
CP 56121

Mexico

**Center for Food Safety**

660 Pennsylvania Ave., SE,  
#302  
Washington DC 20003  
USA

**Citizen against chemical pollution (Japan)**

Z Bldg. 4F, 7-10-1 Kameido, Koto-ku,  
Tokyo, 136-0071  
Japan

**Commonweal**

PO Box 316  
Bolinás, CA 94924  
USA

**Confederation General del Trabajo de la republica Argentina**

Secretaría de Relaciones Internacionales de CGTRA  
Cevallos 520 4º Piso - Buenos Aires  
Argentina

**Food and Water Watch US**

1616 P Street, NW  
Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20036  
USA

**Friends of the Earth United States**

1717 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Suite 600  
Washington DC  
20036-2002  
USA

**Grassroots Alliance PERESVET**

Olega Koshevogo St., 80 of 12,  
241029 Bryansk  
RUSSIA

**Humane Society International**

2100 L St., NW  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
USA

**International Center for Technology Assessment (ICTA)**

660 Pennsylvania Ave., SE  
Suite 302  
Washington, DC 20003  
USA

**International PoPs Elimination Network (IPEN), secretariat**

PO Box 7256  
SE-402 35, Göteborg,  
Sweden

**Institute for Agriculture and Trade Policy (IATP)**

2105 First Avenue South  
Minneapolis MN 55404  
USA

**Island Sustainability Alliance (C.I.) Inc.**

P.O. Box 492  
Rarotonga,  
Cook Islands

**Nanotechnology Citizen Engagement Organization (NanoCEO)**

1311 Lake View Ave.  
Madison, WI 53704  
USA

**National Resources Defense Council (NRDC)**

40 West 20th Street  
New York, NY 10011  
USA

**National Toxic Network Inc. (Australia)**

PO Box 173  
Bangalow NSW 2479  
Australia

**Pesticide Action Network Aotearoa**

PO Box 296  
Ostend  
Waiheke Island  
Auckland 1843  
New Zealand

**Red de Accion sobre Plaguicidas y sus Alternativas para América Latina (RAP-AL)/**

**Pesticide Action Network Latin America**

Centro de Estudios sobre Tecnologías Apropriadas de la Argentina  
Rivadavia 4097  
P.O. Box 89 (1727), Marcos Paz  
Buenos Aires  
Argentina

**SEEPOM**

**Société d'Education Environnementale et de Protection des Oiseaux au Maroc**

N°3 lot 1  
Haj Kaddour  
B.P : 48  
Région de Meknes  
Morocco

**Toxisphera**

Rua Afonso Pena SN - Fundos da Extensão da UEM em Cianorte  
CEP: 87200-000  
CIANORTE - PARANÁ  
Brazil